

Ruby trunk - Feature #2643

test/unit redefinition check of test_* method

01/25/2010 07:41 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

Status:	Closed
Priority:	Normal
Assignee:	sorah (Sorah Fukumori)
Target version:	2.0.0
Description	
<p>=begin Hi, Ryan Davis --</p> <p>When writing test cases with test/unit, we often by mistake define a test function whose name is already used:</p> <pre>class TestFoo < Test::Unit::TestCase def test_some_test # not executed ... end ... def test_some_test # redefined ... end end</pre>	
<p>This leads to a loss of a valuable chance of test. It is good for test/unit to detect and warn such a redefinition.</p> <p>A patch is attached. Could you merge the patch into test/unit? I'm less than picky about the implementation detail and error message.</p> <p>By the attached patch, I actually found eight redefinitions in tests of ruby core :-)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• TestUTF16#test_casecmp<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ defined by akr, redefined by akr• TestHash#test_key?<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ defined by ko1, redefined by ko1• TestHash#test_value?<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ defined by ko1, redefined by ko1• TestProc#test_proc_args_opt_and_block<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ defined by yugui, redefined by yugui• TestEncodingConverter#test_invalid_replace<ul style="list-style-type: none">◦ defined by akr, redefined by akr	

- TestZlibGzipReader#test_gets
 - defined first by mame, redefined by mame
- TestBigDecimal#test_coerce
 - defined first by mame, redefined by nobu
- TestStringScanner#test_inspect
 - defined first by aamine, redefined by mame

--

Yusuke ENDOH mame@tsg.ne.jp

=end

Associated revisions

Revision 7773a911 - 07/21/2012 05:12 AM - sorah (Sorah Fukumori)

- lib/test/unit.rb: warn when test_* method is redefined.
Patch by mame (Yusuke Endoh). [Feature #2643] [ruby-core:27790]
- test/testunit/test_redefinition.rb: Test for above.
- test/testunit/test4test_redefinition.rb: Ditto.

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@36484 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 36484 - 07/21/2012 05:12 AM - sorah (Sorah Fukumori)

- lib/test/unit.rb: warn when test_* method is redefined.
Patch by mame (Yusuke Endoh). [Feature #2643] [ruby-core:27790]
- test/testunit/test_redefinition.rb: Test for above.
- test/testunit/test4test_redefinition.rb: Ditto.

Revision 36484 - 07/21/2012 05:12 AM - sorah (Sorah Fukumori)

- lib/test/unit.rb: warn when test_* method is redefined.
Patch by mame (Yusuke Endoh). [Feature #2643] [ruby-core:27790]
- test/testunit/test_redefinition.rb: Test for above.
- test/testunit/test4test_redefinition.rb: Ditto.

Revision 36484 - 07/21/2012 05:12 AM - sorah (Sorah Fukumori)

- lib/test/unit.rb: warn when test_* method is redefined.
Patch by mame (Yusuke Endoh). [Feature #2643] [ruby-core:27790]
- test/testunit/test_redefinition.rb: Test for above.

- test/testunit/test4test_redefinition.rb: Ditto.

Revision 36484 - 07/21/2012 05:12 AM - sorah (Sorah Fukumori)

- lib/test/unit.rb: warn when test_* method is redefined.
Patch by mame (Yusuke Endoh). [Feature #2643] [ruby-core:27790]
- test/testunit/test_redefinition.rb: Test for above.
- test/testunit/test4test_redefinition.rb: Ditto.

Revision 36484 - 07/21/2012 05:12 AM - sorah (Sorah Fukumori)

- lib/test/unit.rb: warn when test_* method is redefined.
Patch by mame (Yusuke Endoh). [Feature #2643] [ruby-core:27790]
- test/testunit/test_redefinition.rb: Test for above.
- test/testunit/test4test_redefinition.rb: Ditto.

Revision 36484 - 07/21/2012 05:12 AM - sorah (Sorah Fukumori)

- lib/test/unit.rb: warn when test_* method is redefined.
Patch by mame (Yusuke Endoh). [Feature #2643] [ruby-core:27790]
- test/testunit/test_redefinition.rb: Test for above.
- test/testunit/test4test_redefinition.rb: Ditto.

History

#1 - 01/25/2010 10:52 PM - Eregon (Benoit Daloze)

=begin

This leads to a loss of a valuable chance of test. It is good for test/unit to detect and warn such a redefinition.

I think you can already see them with warning enabled:
(in Ruby 1.9.2)

test.rb:163: warning: method redefined; discarding old test_one

test.rb:160: warning: previous definition of test_one was here

(in 1.8.7)

test.rb:163: warning: method redefined; discarding old test_one

B.D.

=end

#2 - 01/25/2010 11:15 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

=begin

2010/1/25 Benoit Daloze eregontp@gmail.com:

This leads to a loss of a valuable chance of test. It is good for test/unit to detect and warn such a redefinition.

I think you can already see them with warning enabled:
(in Ruby 1.9.2)
test.rb:163: warning: method redefined; discarding old test_one
test.rb:160: warning: previous definition of test_one was here
(in 1.8.7)
test.rb:163: warning: method redefined; discarding old test_one

The warning is very forgetful. It is waste of time and intelligence for all test/unit users to enable the warning. In addition, method redefinition is not always wrong.

But, it is reasonable to enable all warning during test. If so, it is also good for test/unit to enable warning by default, I think.

--
Yusuke ENDOH mame@tsq.ne.jp

=end

#3 - 09/14/2010 04:06 PM - shyouhei (Shyouhei Urabe)

- Status changed from Open to Assigned

=begin

=end

#4 - 07/16/2011 07:23 AM - zenspider (Ryan Davis)

- Status changed from Assigned to Open

- Assignee deleted (zenspider (Ryan Davis))

I agree with Benoit. -w is there for a reason. If you're willing to ignore warnings coming from ruby, why would adding another line that says essentially the same thing be any better?

Regardless, I don't maintain test/unit, but I vote that this ticket be rejected.

#5 - 03/18/2012 03:11 PM - nahi (Hiroshi Nakamura)

- Assignee set to sorah (Sorah Fukumori)

Shota, please handle this. We also added you as a maintainer of test/unit. <http://bugs.ruby-lang.org/projects/ruby/wiki/Maintainers>

#6 - 03/18/2012 06:46 PM - shyouhei (Shyouhei Urabe)

- Status changed from Open to Assigned

#7 - 07/21/2012 02:12 PM - sorah (Sorah Fukumori)

- Status changed from Assigned to Closed

- % Done changed from 0 to 100

This issue was solved with changeset [r36484](#).
Yusuke, thank you for reporting this issue.
Your contribution to Ruby is greatly appreciated.
May Ruby be with you.

-
- lib/test/unit.rb: warn when test_* method is redefined.
Patch by mame (Yusuke Endoh). [Feature [#2643](#)] [ruby-core:27790]
 - test/testunit/test_redefinition.rb: Test for above.
 - test/testunit/test4test_redefinition.rb: Ditto.

Files

test-unit-redefinition-check.patch	565 Bytes	01/25/2010	mame (Yusuke Endoh)
------------------------------------	-----------	------------	---------------------